

**FRYDERYK ROZEN<sup>1</sup>**

Warszawa

ORCID 0000-0002-0580-8178

## THE 15TH-CENTURY EDITION OF THE PAULINE MISSAL AS A SOURCE FOR GREGORIAN CHANT HISTORY

### Piętnastowieczna edycja Mszału Paulińskiego źródłem do dziejów Chorału Gregoriańskiego Abstrakt

Istnieje jedynie kilka średniowiecznych kodeksów zawierających notację muzyczną Mszy w rycie paulińskim. Istotnym źródłem do badań nad paulińską muzyką liturgiczną jest *Missale Eremitarum S. Pauli* wydrukowany przez Johanna Amerbacha ok. 1490 roku. Celem artykułu jest omówienie miejsc pozostawionych przez drukarza pod odrębne wpisanie neum. Miejsce pod notację muzyczną zostało przygotowane we fragmentach *Ordinarium Missae*, obrzędach Niedzieli Palmowej i Wielkiego Piątku. W sześciu zachowanych egzemplarzach neumy zostały wpisane w odmiennym zakresie. Opracowanie proveniencyjne wykazało, iż egzemplarze były używane w klasztorach kilku krajów.

**Słowa kluczowe:** paulini, inkunabuły, mszał, liturgia średniowieczna

### Abstract

There exist only few medieval codices containing musical notation for the Mass in the Pauline rite. *Missale Eremitarum S. Pauli* printed by Johannes Amerbach about 1490 is a significant source for further research of the Pauline liturgical music. The objective of this article is to discuss the blank spaces left especially for the addition of handwritten neumes. The space for musical notation was prepared by the printer for parts of the *Ordinarium Missae*, in ceremonies of the Palm Sunday and Good Friday. In six remaining copies of the missal the neumes were inscribed in various ways. The study of the provenance shows that these copies were used in the monasteries in several countries.

**Keywords:** Pauline Fathers, incunabula, missal, medieval liturgy

<sup>1</sup> Dr. Fryderyk Rozen, historian. A graduate of the Faculty of Historical and Social Sciences of the Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński University in Warsaw. He specializes in incunabulum and book culture of the Grand Duchy of Lithuania. Email: [rozen.fryderyk@gmail.com](mailto:rozen.fryderyk@gmail.com).

## Introduction

The features of the individual liturgical books of the Pauline Order, such as their own texts of offices, the calendar of feasts and arrangement of rituals, included characteristic musical notation.<sup>2</sup> The source base for learning Pauline Mass chants is very modest. It consists of several liturgical books that survived the enormous destruction of medieval Hungarian written texts.<sup>3</sup> A gradual sheet of the fourteenth century has been preserved and is kept in the Hungarian National Archives. The oldest source for research on Pauline chant comes from the end of the 14th century – a missal in the library of the Benedictine abbey in Göttweig.<sup>4</sup> The fifteenth century is represented by a missal in the library of the Benedictine Abbey in Göttweig, a travelling missal from the State Archive in Sopron, a gradual in the Jasna Góra Library and fragments of graduals in the Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Hungarian National Széchényi Library, and the Cathedral Archives in Zagreb.<sup>5</sup> Melodies from the early 16th century are contained in the handwritten Pauline missal in the Jasna Góra Library.<sup>6</sup> The oldest chronicle of the Order, *Vitae Fratrum Eremitarum* by the Order's General Gregory Gyöngyösi, contains a few references to Mass chant.<sup>7</sup>

It is possible to expand the source base for research on the origins of Pauline music by drawing attention to the Order's first printed missal.<sup>8</sup> Among the sources for research on Pauline chant, Domonkos Farkas mentioned a copy of the missal in the Hungarian National Széchényi Library (ref. Inc. 176).<sup>9</sup> The musical notation contained therein was handwritten in blank spaces specially left by the printer above the printed text. Other places intended for neumes remained unused. Given the individualism of medieval rituals, an examination of the missal preserved in Budapest leads to two questions: for which fragments of the Mass did the Pauline editor provide space for the notation of the melody, and how was this space used in the individual monasteries of the Order developing at the end of the Middle Ages in

<sup>2</sup> G. Sarbak, *Das Buch- und Bibliothekswesen der Pauliner im Mittelalter*, in: *Beiträge zur Geschichte des Paulinerordens*, ed. K. Elm, Berlin 2000, p. 46.

<sup>3</sup> *Bibliotheca Hungarica. Kódexek és nyomtatott könyvek Magyarországon 1526 előtt*, vol. 1: A-J, ed. C. Csapodi, K. Csapodiné Gárdonyi, Budapest, 1988, p. 7.

<sup>4</sup> G. Gilányi, *Preservation, Continuity, Archaism – Musical Notation in the Pauline Order between the 14<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> Centuries*, in: *Liturgy and Music in the History of the Pauline Order*, ed. E. Mateja, R. Pošpiech, Opole 2018, p. 154.

<sup>5</sup> D. Farkas, *The main research results of Pauline Liturgical Chant in Hungary*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce. Źródła i początki*, ed. R. Pošpiech, Opole 2012, p. 416-422; P. Radó, *Libri liturgici manuscripti bibliothecarum Hungariae et limitropharum regionum*, Budapest 1973, p. 172.

<sup>6</sup> J. Kubieniec, *Średniowieczne rękopisy liturgiczne z archiwum jasnogórskiego*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce...*, p. 138-139; L. Pietras, *Choral gregoriański w dokumentach i praktyce paulinów*, "Dissertationes paulinorum", 18/2009, p. 13-14. The valuable missal has been made available in the form of a phototype edition with rich scientific commentary: *Mszal Jagiellonów z Jasnej Góry. Wydanie fototypiczne*, ed. R. Pošpiech, Opole 2013, „Musica Claromontana. Studia”, vol. 2. On the Jagiellonian Missal see also J. Kubieniec, *Liturgia paulińska w Polsce. Źródła i specyfika*, in: *Liturgy and Music...*, p. 44-45.

<sup>7</sup> According to the 1478 decree of General Thomas, a Mass begun with singing should be sung to the end. G. Gyöngyösi, *Vitae Fratrum Ordinis Sancti Pauli Primi Eremitae*, ed. Franciscus Hervay, Bibliotheca Scriptorum Medii Recentisque Aevorum. Seria Nova, vol. XI, Budapest 1988, cap. 62; General Peter of Zalonkemen ruling the Order from 1488 to 1492 forbade singing in a too high voice as tiring the friars and weakening piety, *ibidem*, cap. 68; in Buda, the hermit brothers sang solemn Masses, *ibidem*, cap. 64.

<sup>8</sup> G. Kiss, *Pre-Tridentine sources of the Pauline Mass chant repertory*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce...*, p. 200, 208.

<sup>9</sup> D. Farkas, *op. cit.*, p. 418.

several central European countries? These musical fragments, sometimes even small ones, deserve closer attention. In the study of musical palaeography, one should collect “all kinds of documents containing musical notation.”<sup>10</sup> Neumes added in missals belong to an interesting layer of musical notation – intermediate between the great choral codes and practical notation, i.e., informal, italicised notes by performers, students, teachers, and other practitioners of musical life.<sup>11</sup> For each copy, it will be important to determine its provenance so that it is possible to indicate the place of origin of the musical notation.

### The printed text

The first edition of the Pauline Missal was compiled by Anthonius de Tata.<sup>12</sup> The first edition was published without a publishing address.<sup>13</sup> Typographic analysis indicates that the incunabulum came from Johannes Amerbach’s printing house in Basel. The first edition of the Pauline Breviary was also published in this important fifteenth-century printing centre.<sup>14</sup> Amerbach was one of the outstanding Renaissance typographers collaborating with humanist circles.<sup>15</sup> Amerbach did not belong to the liturgical printers – apart from the Pauline Missal, he did not publish any more books of this type. He did not print neumes, although the printing art of that time had already made this possible for 20 years thanks to the invention of double printing. This method was probably first used in the so-called *Constantinian Gradual*, though there is some opinion that a woodcut was used there. This incunabulum does not contain the publisher’s address, and it is assumed that it was produced around 1473 in one of the publishing houses in southern Germany or in Konstanz.<sup>16</sup> Shortly thereafter, the Roman typographer Ulrich Hann published a Roman missal indisputably containing printed notes.<sup>17</sup> The rapid development of music typography began in Italy, France, and the German countries. The number of musical incunabula known today is 270 titles.<sup>18</sup>

Missals with musical parts were published for the needs of dioceses and religious orders. The *Gesamtkatalog der Wiegendrucke* records thirty-five editions of fifteenth-century monastic missals. Of this number, musical notation was placed in fifteen editions. On seven occasions, the fathers chose to print it in its entirety, i.e., they printed it in four lines and neumes. The Dominicans led the way, organising five times the publication of their missals containing printed neumes. Twice the Carmelites followed in their footsteps and once the

<sup>10</sup> J. Szendrei, *Notacja liniowa w polskich źródłach chorałowych XII-XVI wieku*, in: *Notae musicae artis*, ed. E. Witkowska-Zaremba, Kraków 1999, p. 188.

<sup>11</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>12</sup> J. Török, *A magyar pálosrend liturgiájának forrásai, kialakulása és főbb sajátosságai (1225-1600)*, Budapest 1977, p. 21.

<sup>13</sup> Bibliographic description see: *Gesamtkatalog der Wiegendrucke*, M23909, <https://www.gesamtkatalogderwiegendrucke.de/> (accessed 3 June 2023); I. Hubay, *Missalia hungarica*, Budapest 1938, p. 62.

<sup>14</sup> E. Soltész, *Die Erstausgabe des Pauliner-Breviers*, „Gutenberg Jahrbuch”, 35/1960, p. 132-140.

<sup>15</sup> F. Geldner, *Printers and printing XV century*, in: *Encyclopedia of Library and Information Science*, vol. 23, New York 1978, p. 303; B. Halpron, *The correspondence of Johan Amerbach*, Michigan 2000, p. 3-4; F. Geldner, *Die deutschen Inkunabeldrucker: ein Handbuch der deutschen Buchdrucker des XV. Jahrhunderts nach Druckorten*, Stuttgart 1968-1970, vol. 1, p. 118-120.

<sup>16</sup> P. Gancarczyk, *Muzyka wobec rewolucji druku. Przemiany w kulturze muzycznej XVI wieku*, Toruń 2011, p. 26.

<sup>17</sup> M. Przywecka-Samecka, *Drukarstwo muzyczne w Europie do końca XVIII wieku*, Wrocław 1987, p. 23; eadem, *Początki drukarstwa muzycznego w Europie. Wiek XV*, Wrocław 1981, p. 13-14.

<sup>18</sup> P. Gancarczyk, op. cit., p. 27.

Franciscans.<sup>19</sup> Almost as many as eight times the inscription of the neumes was left to copyists, printing monastic missals with only four lines or a blank space for musical notation.<sup>20</sup> This was an old method, still used by Johann Fust and Peter Schöffer in the *Mainz Psalter* of 1457.<sup>21</sup> Two Benedictine missals, two Dominican missals, one Humiliati, and one Franciscan missal took this form. This also included the first printed Pauline missal.<sup>22</sup> As can be seen, books that included any kind of musical notation accounted for a small, albeit significant, part of the total number of printed missals. On the other hand, it was a rare phenomenon for impresarios to be entrusted with the printing of neumes.

The musical excerpts from the first Pauline missal were printed using a more common method, i.e., leaving a blank space above the parts of the sung text. Why did the Pauline fathers decide to use such a solution? Well, fifteenth-century musical notation used, in addition to single neumes, a very large number of signs – ligatures, keys, custodians, etc., all in many local variations. In order to render them all in print, typographers would have needed a very large number of fonts. Therefore, most of them simplified musical notation by reducing it to basic characters. Only in specialised publishing houses did the musical parts faithfully reproduce the manuscripts.<sup>23</sup> However, even the best printers did not convince all ecclesiastical authorities to entrust themselves with musical notation. The risk of its distortion proved too strong and many times even the best music publishing houses pressed liturgical books without neumes. Examples include the Esztergom missals from the excellent Venetian publishing houses of Johann Hamman, Emerich de Spira, and Georg Stuchs. Only the missal of 1512 contains the Roman version of notation and then, in subsequent editions, notations alone returned.<sup>24</sup> Perhaps the concern for the accuracy of the musical notation among the Hungarian clergy and Pauline fathers was caused by the fact that Venetian or Swiss printers rarely had contact with the Hungarian liturgy, working for Italian and German clients on a daily basis. Thus, the abandonment of the services of the music publishing house seems to be a conscious effort to entrust the notation of notes to the work of their own scriptoria.

In printed missals, space for neumes was left next to prayers said or sung by the priest or deacon, while parts for the choir were written in graduals, sequences, etc. Moreover, the arrangement of musical parts in fifteenth-century printed missals was not subject to rigid regulations and was quite diverse. Neumes most often appeared in prefaces and the canon, and often accompanied sequences. Beyond this, however, their inclusion in individual texts was the result of individual decisions made by the editors responsible for publishing the book. Their choices gave the missals distinctive features that contributed to the identity of the liturgy of individual dioceses and religious orders. Thus, the description of the texts combined in the missal with space for musical notation fits into the search for the specific characteristics of the liturgical books of the Pauline Order.

<sup>19</sup> K. Meyer-Baer, *Liturgical music incunabula. A descriptive catalogue*, London 1962, p. 212, 215-220. Ibidem, p. 207-211, 213-214, 221.

<sup>20</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>21</sup> O. Kinkeldey, *Music and Music Printing in Incunabula*, "The Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America," 26/1932, p. 103.

<sup>22</sup> K. Meyer-Baer, op. cit., p. 207-211.

<sup>23</sup> P. Gancarczyk, op. cit., p. 30.

<sup>24</sup> M. Przywecka-Samecka, *Początki drukarstwa muzycznego...*, p. 95.

In printed monastic missals, the musical fragments had varied sizes. The smallest set of texts with neumes included the basic and most frequently used fragments of the liturgy: intonations of various versions of the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, *Credo*, prefaces, *Pater noster* and *Pax Domini sit semper vobiscum*.<sup>25</sup> This set of basic chorale fragments was a common element in most missals. Other musical fragments appeared less frequently. They mostly came from the rites of the great feasts, most often from Holy Week. There were often antiphons from the adoration of the cross, improperia, the Good Friday prayer of the faithful and the beginning of the *Gloria* of Holy Saturday.<sup>26</sup> Other texts were accompanied by musical notation less frequently. This was done, for example, by the Dominicans with the antiphons to the *Magnificat* on Holy Thursday and Holy Saturday.<sup>27</sup> Rare examples of other chants rendered in print include the incipits of the antiphon *ad Benedictum* in the Christmas laudes, the blessing of ashes on Ash Wednesday, the blessing of candles on the Feast of the Purification of the Blessed Virgin Mary, and the beginning of the *Gloria* on the Vigil of Pentecost in one Dominican Missal.<sup>28</sup>

The arrangement of these fragments in the religious missals is also important. Very often they are found in different parts of the books rather than collected as an appendix on separate pages, as was repeatedly practised in diocesan missals, treating the musical fragments as an optional element, intended only for interested priests. The Hungarian clergy made very modest use of the possibilities of music printing. The two editions of the missal according to the archdiocesan rite included four lines in and before the canon.<sup>29</sup>

In the first edition of the Pauline missal, space is provided for musical notation in several places. Starting with the most frequently performed chants, these are: the conclusion of the Canon: *Per omnia saecula saeculorum. Amen*, the chant accompanying the breaking of bread: *Per omnia saecula saeculorum. Amen. Pax Domini sit semper vobiscum*. The response *Et cum spiritu tuo*, shortened to just *Et* is left without a place for the melody. Further space for neumes is provided at the introduction to the *Pater noster*: *Oremus. Praeceptis salutaribus moniti, et divina institutione formati, audemus dicere*. The Lord's Prayer itself, along with the introduction, was printed twice, with space for both festive and weekday melodies. At the very end of the missal, further elements of the *Ordinarium Missae* are collected, for which space is provided to write a melody. Firstly, two versions of the dismissal from the Lenten Mass – *Benedicamus Domino* – are included. Next comes the *Kyrie* for weekdays. This is followed by ten versions of the melody for the *Kyrie*, *Gloria in excelsis* and *Ite missa est*. The texts of the Marian Mass are given first. These are followed by three sets containing

<sup>25</sup> P. Gancarczyk, op. cit., p. 30.

<sup>26</sup> E.g., *Missale Carmelitarum*, Brescia: B. de Boninis, 1490, GW M24129.

<sup>27</sup> *Missale Fratrum Praedicatorum*, Venezia: N. von Frankfurt, 1484, GW M24169. Fewer Holy Week melodies are included in *Missale Fratrum Praedicatorum*, Venezia: J. Hamann, 1494, GW M24173 and *Missale ordinis praedicatorum*, Venezia: J.E. de Spira, 1500, GW M24165.

<sup>28</sup> *Missale Fratrum Praedicatorum*, Venezia: A. Torresanus, 1496, GW M24178.

<sup>29</sup> *Missale Strigoniense*, Venezia: J.E. de Spira, 1500/502, GW M24756; *Missale Strigoniense*, Venezia: J. Emericus, de Spira, 1498, GW M24754. K; Meyer-Baer, op. cit., p. 189-190.

*Kyrie* interspersed with tropes: *Kyrie Cunctipotens*,<sup>30</sup> *Kyrie magnae Deus*,<sup>31</sup> *Kyrie fons*<sup>32</sup> and *Kyrie Baksa*, as well as *Kyrie* sets for Sundays, Masses for the Apostles, and two sets for Eastertide. Then, there are two intonations of the chant *Asperges me Domine* – for Sundays and feasts – and the intonation of *Vidi aquam* sung during Eastertide. This musical part of the missal concludes with another intonation of the *Kyrie*, provided for weekday Masses except on Christmas Eve and in Lent, and the *Benedicamus Domino* sung from the second Sunday after Epiphany to Ash Wednesday.

In the manner typical of many 15th-century missals, a place for neumes was left for the prefaces, a section of the Mass showing strong diversity at the time.<sup>33</sup> In addition to the variety of texts, the pluralism of the medieval liturgy also consisted of several melodies for a single preface text. For example, the missal of the Meissen diocese of 1495 contained a total of 26 melodies for 12 texts. There were different chants for weekdays, others for Sundays, and others for feasts.<sup>34</sup>

Fifteen prefaces are printed in the studied missal.<sup>35</sup> The two prefaces of weekdays and the preface of funeral Masses have an introductory dialogue,<sup>36</sup> an opening formula,<sup>37</sup> and a variable text specific to each preface (preface embolism). The variable text of the preface of the Apostles and Evangelists (*Te Domine suppliciter exorare...*) and the Easter preface (*Te quidem Domine omni tempore...*) are preceded by an introductory formula, apparently providing for a separate melody for this part of the celebration. For the remaining prefaces, the variable parts alone are given, preceded by the introduction of the *Aeterne Deus*. These are the prefaces of Christmas (*Quia per incarnati verbi mysterium...*), Epiphany (*Quia cum Unigenitus tuus...*), weekdays and Sundays of Lent (twice the same text: *Qui corporali ieiunio...*), Maundy Thursday (*Qui salutem humani generis...*), Ascension (*Qui post resurrectionem...*), the Holy Spirit (*Qui ascendens super omnes...*), the Mother of God (*Et te in Annuciatione...*), the Holy Cross (*Qui Salutem Humani Generis ...*).

The set of prefaces in the Pauline missal is close to the Esztergom Use, from which the ancient Pauline liturgy was derived.<sup>38</sup> The only textual differences are found in the preface of the Marian Masses. According to the Esztergom Use, the variable part of the preface begins with the words: *Et te in veneratione beatae Mariae semper virginis...* The Pauline missal introduced more texts for the Marian feasts of the Annunciation, Visitation, Assumption, Nativity, and Immaculate Conception.

<sup>30</sup> Several versions of the *Kyrie* with tropes began with *Cunctipotens: Cunctipotens genitor, Cunctipotens orbis factor, and Cunctipotens dominator. Analecta hymnica Medii Aevi*, vol. XLVII, Leipzig 1905, p. 50, 65, 146.

<sup>31</sup> *Analecta hymnica...*, p. 158.

<sup>32</sup> In *Analecta hymnica...* there are two troped *Kyrie* beginning with *Kyrie fons bonitatis* and *Fons et origio, Analecta hymnica...*, p. 53, 70-71.

<sup>33</sup> A. Nowowiejski, *Msza święta*, Płock 1993, p. 755-757.

<sup>34</sup> *Missale Misnense*, Freiberg: C. Kachelofen, 1495, GW M24538.

<sup>35</sup> *Missale Eremitarum Ordinis S. Pauli*, fol. LXXXVIv – Clr.

<sup>36</sup> *Per omnia saecula saeculorum. Dominus vobiscum. Et cum spiritu tuo. Sursum corda. Habemus ad Dominum. Gratias agamus Domino, Deo nostro. Dignum et iustum est.*

<sup>37</sup> *Vere dignum et iustum est, equum et salutare nos tibi semper et ubique gratias agere, domine sancte Pater omnipotens aeterne Deus.*

<sup>38</sup> J. Török, *Die Paulinerliturgie in Ungarn*, in: *Beiträge zur Geschichte des Paulinerordens*, red. K. Elm, Berlin 2000, p. 132; M.I. Földvály, *Pauline Customs and the Esztergom Use*, in: *Liturgy and Music...*, p. 60-61.

There are twelve prefaces in the first printed Esztergom missal,<sup>39</sup> three fewer than in the Pauline version. However, the number of texts is the same: eleven in both missals. In both missals, the words of the ordinary preface are printed twice, once under the heading *Praefatio cottidiana* and again as the preface used on *dies feriales*. In the Pauline missal, the words of this preface were repeated for the third time, this time for use in funeral Masses. The Pauline fathers also provided separate melodies for the words of the Lenten preface, which they defined once as a preface of the Sundays of Lent and then as a preface of weekdays of that period of the church year. In the Pauline missal, the same words appear in the prefaces of Maundy Thursday and the Holy Cross. In the Esztergom missal, they appear as a single unit (*In Cena Domini et de Sancta Cruce*). An important difference between the two books is also the fact that the diocesan editors provided musical notation for only one ordinary preface, placed first. In the absence of a melody, there was no reason to repeat the same lyrics. The list of differences between the Esztergom and Pauline missals can be supplemented by some differences in the endings of the prefaces.<sup>40</sup> Compared to the Esztergom liturgy, the Pauline missal shows the individuality of the monastic rites developed on the basis of the Esztergom Use.

The chants of the Holy Week liturgy, small in volume and yet constituting a peculiarity of the Pauline missal, in many diocesan and monastic missals were given without neumes. Musical notation appears in the Palm Sunday procession, which is a special, dramatised rite combining liturgical celebration with imagery of events from biblical history. A place for musical notation was provided above the texts of the Palm Sunday procession recreating Christ's entry into Jerusalem. The rich musical setting was mostly performed by the choir. The singing of the priest was heard during the so-called *Statio Crucis*. The procession stopped, two liturgical assistants laid branches and vestments in front of the cross. These actions were accompanied by antiphons describing the crowd joyfully welcoming Christ. Then, all those present fell to their knees to honour the cross. This climax was accompanied by the singing of an antiphon based on the words of St Mark's Gospel (14:27-28) *Scriptum est enim percutiam pastorem et dispergentur oves gregis, postquam autem surrexero, praecedam vos in Galilaeam, ibi me videbitis*.<sup>41</sup> The priest sang alone up to and including the *pastorem*, and then the choir joined in the singing.

As the Palm Sunday rites continue, the place for neumes returns in the reading from the Gospel of St Matthew. This time, the music highlights the words spoken by the dying Christ: *Helii, helii lama zabathani. Hoc est Deus meus, Deus meus, ut quid dereliquisti me?*<sup>42</sup> (Mt 27:46). There is also space to enter a melody next to Christ's last words in the readings of the Passion according to St Mark on Holy Tuesday: *Heloi, Heloi lama zabathani quod*

<sup>39</sup> *Missale Strigoniense 1484. Monumenta Ritualia Hungarica 1*, ed. B. Déri, Budapest 2009, p. 217-220.

<sup>40</sup> In four cases, the text in the Pauline missal ends at the very beginning of the concluding formulae of the prefaces. In the Christmas and Ascension prefaces, the Pauline editors brought the words to *Et ideo cum*, while the Esztergom editors brought the formula to the end in the first case and to *cumque omni militia* in the second. The ending of the Lenten and Maundy Thursday prefaces in the Pauline missal was brought to *per quem majestatem* (in the weekday version even shorter – to *per quem*). The Esztergom version goes a little further in the former case, to *tuam laudant angeli*, and in the latter to *tremunt potestates*. The text at the end of the preface of the Apostles and Evangelists is longer in the Pauline version than in the Esztergom, while in the Esztergom it goes as far as *et ideo cum angelis*.

<sup>41</sup> *Missale Eremitarum...*, fol. LXII r.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibidem*, fol. LXVI r.

*est interpretatum Deus meus, Deus meus ut quid dereliquisti me?*<sup>43</sup> and St Luke on Holy Wednesday: *Pater in manus tuas commendo spiritum meum.*<sup>44</sup>

The next texts with space for musical notation over them belong to the Good Friday liturgy of the adoration of the cross. Neumes could be written over the three parts of the improperia, sung by two priests: *Popule meus, quid feci tibi? Aut in quo constrictavi te? Responde mihi. Quia eduxi te de terra Aegypti, parasti crucem salvatori tuo.* Here the transcript follows the very text of the chant performed by two friars. The neumes return with the singing of the priests: *Quia eduxi te per desertum quadraginta annos et manna cibavi te et introduxi in terram satis optimam parasti crucem salvatori tuo.*

The invocations *Agios o Theos, Sanctus Deus* are again devoid of neumes, which revert to the last part performed by the priests: *Quid ultra debui facere tibi, et non feci? Ego quidem plantavi te vineam meam speciosissimam et tu facta es mihi nimis amara: aceto namque sitim meam potasti et lancea perforasti latus Salvatori tuo.*<sup>45</sup> As the adoration of the cross continues, the celebrant stands in front of the altar and, taking up the cross, intones the *Ecce lignum crucis* antiphon, after which his voice joins the choir in singing *in quo salus mundi pependit, venite adoremus.*<sup>46</sup> Another musical notation is provided for the antiphon *Tuam crucem adoramus domine tuam gloriosam recolimus passionem miserere nostri qui passus es pro nobis.*<sup>47</sup> When the adoration is over, the altar is approached by an assisting party with a ladle, two candles, followed by a subdeacon carrying an ampoule of water. Closing the procession, the deacon carrying the Host sings the verse: *Laudes omnipotens canimus tibi donna ferentes. Corporis immensi, sanguinis atquem tui.*<sup>48</sup> The choir repeats the verse, followed by a notation of the entire text with space for neumes: *Pangimus ecce tuam rector sanctissime mensam. Tu licet indignis propiciare tuis.* The verse *Corporis... Angelus ethereis sanctus descendat ab astris. Purificans corpus cor pariterque prius* is repeated. The verse *Laudes...* is repeated. *Haec medicina potens celi nos ducat in arces. Interea terris dans medicamen opis.* The verse *Corporis...* is repeated. *Hoc pater omnipotens cum Christo suscipe clemens, Spiritus atque potens trinus et unus apex.* Later in the liturgy, the musical notation still returns during the priest's singing of *Hoc corpus* and continues with the choir: *quod pro vobis tradetur.*<sup>49</sup> In the rites of the Paschal Vigil, a place for neumes has been prepared for the entire *Exultet*, the *Alleluia* before the Gospel and the concluding liturgy sung by the deacon *Ite missa est. Alleluia. Alleluia.*<sup>50</sup>

## Chapter Two

Medieval monastic rituals knew cases of unification of the choral as well as acceptance of local customs. Square notation was obligatory for the Franciscans and Dominicans while

<sup>43</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXII r.

<sup>44</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXVI v.

<sup>45</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXIV v. – LXXXV r.

<sup>46</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXV r.

<sup>47</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXV r.

<sup>48</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXVI r.

<sup>49</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXVI v.

<sup>50</sup> Ibidem, fol. LXXXVIII v. – LXXXV r.



in other orders it was only optional and appeared alternately with the Gothic notation.<sup>51</sup> In the Franciscan Order, the instruction *Ista rubrica* of 1292 ordered the faithful to copy the contents of liturgical books. Before binding, new books underwent a threefold comparative check with master copies.<sup>52</sup> This system worked very effectively, as can be seen from the codices preserved today.<sup>53</sup> It was different, for example, with the notation of the Cistercian codices, in which regional influences show.<sup>54</sup> The freedom in notation systems has given some records a unique character.<sup>55</sup>

A complete copy is kept in Basel University Library (ref. AN VIII 56). According to a handwritten provenance note, the missal comes from the Pauline monastery of Our Lady in Ranna, Austria.<sup>56</sup> This monastery was founded in 1414 thanks to the foundation of Baron Jan Neidegh,<sup>57</sup> so it is likely that Divine Service was performed there using the Amerbach missal. The convent's history came to an end with the Josephinist dissolutions.<sup>58</sup> In this copy, neumes are entered for a fragment of the Palm Sunday Gospel (*Helia, helii* etc.), all prefaces, the ending of the Canon, both versions of the *Pater noster* with introductions and the Communion rites. On the final recto sheet with intonations, the melody is entered for most of the kyriale texts – except for *Benedicamus Domino* and some versions of the *Kyrie*.

The copy in the Croatian National and University Library in Zagreb (ref. RI-4°-63) has two provenance notations. On the first page of the calendar is inscribed: *Monasterii Lepoglavensis Cat. inscriptus 1628*.<sup>59</sup> The monastery of Leopoglava, dedicated to the Blessed Virgin Mary was founded around 1400.<sup>60</sup> It was destroyed by the Turks in 1481 and then quickly rebuilt.<sup>61</sup> The earlier entry on page 21 of the recto is very interesting: *Missale secundum morem Zagrabiensem emptum per me fratrem Michaelem de Babochja in die sanctorum apostolorum Petri et Pauli [...] anno Domini 1521*. Defining the Pauline missal as conforming to the customs of Zagreb may indicate the adaptation of the book to the local rite, making it an important source of knowledge about local variations of the Order's liturgy. In this copy, musical notation is written for the improperia, the *Ecce lignum crucis* antiphon, and the beginning of the *Hoc corpus*. Only a very brief musical notation has been added above

<sup>51</sup> J. Szendrei, op. cit., p. 198.

<sup>52</sup> J. Norel, *Gradual franciszkański z Plocka. Rękopis ms. 3IV5B z XIII w. z Biblioteki Wyższego Seminarium Duchownego w Plocku w świetle polskiej i europejskiej tradycji liturgiczno-muzycznej. Studium źródłoznawcze*, Kraków 2007, p. 77-80.

<sup>53</sup> J. Pikulik, *Śpiewy allelujacyjne na niedziele po Zesłaniu Ducha Świętego jako kryterium ustalania proveniencji polskich rękopisów muzycznych*, in: *W kierunku chrześcijańskiej kultury*, red. B. Bejze, Warszawa 1978, p. 688. H. Cempura describes the identical text of the Mandatum in the four Franciscan graduals. H. Cempura, *Franciszkańskie mandatum w średniowiecznych rękopisach w Polsce*, "Musica Medii Aevi", 3/1969, p. 118.

<sup>54</sup> J. Szendrei, op. cit., p. 192.

<sup>55</sup> E. Witkowska-Zaremba, *Wprowadzenie*, in: *Notae musicae artis. Notacja muzyczna w źródłach polskich XI-XVI wieku*, ed. E. Witkowska-Zaremba, Kraków 1999, p. 10.

<sup>56</sup> P. van der Haegen, *Basler Wiegendrucke. Verzeichnis der in Basel gedruckten Inkunabeln von Berthold Ruppel bis Nikolaus Kessler mit ausführlicher Beschreibung der in Basel vorhandenen Exemplare*, Basel 1985, p. 52.

<sup>57</sup> E. Kisbán, *Historia zakonu paulinów macierzystej prowincji węgierskiej*, transl. B. Natoński, Jasna Góra 2009, vol. 1, p. 89, 138. It is worth noting Kisbán's mention that until the 17th century, a Pauline missal published in 1537 was kept in Ranna. *Ibidem*, p. 177, vol. 2 p. 421.

<sup>58</sup> E. Kisbán, op. cit., vol. 2, p. 500.

<sup>59</sup> Nacionalna i sveučilišna knjižnica u Zagrebu, <https://www.nsk.hr/ispis-rezultata/> (accessed 1 June 2023).

<sup>60</sup> *Vitae Fratrum... (Appendix II)*, p. 229.

<sup>61</sup> E. Kisbán, op. cit., vol. 1, p. 179.

the text of the *Exultet*. In the fixed parts, neumes are entered for the beginning of the *Pater noster*, Communion rites, and almost all the prefaces, apart from the beginning of the first preface of weekdays. Melodies for the intonation *Benedicamus Domino* are written in full.<sup>62</sup>

Subsequent copies have no ownership records. In the missal from the Cambridge University Library collection (ref.: Inc.2.G.8.3[839]), neumes are written over most of the prefaces. A blank space is left over the beginning of the first preface of weekdays and the entire second preface of feasts, the preface of weekdays of Lent and the preface of the Holy Cross.<sup>63</sup> Other melody notations are included in the Good Friday rites: the improvers, the beginning of the *Ecce lignum crucis* antiphon, the verse *Laudes omnipotens canimus, Pangimus ecce* and *Hoc Corpus quod*. The *Exultet* melody is included in the Paschal Vigil rites.

The copy in the Jasna Góra Library has been associated with the Czestochowa monastery from the 15th century, as indicated by the entry: *Hoc scripsit Thomas de Czestohowa*.<sup>64</sup> The sheets with a 15th-century liturgical manuscript attached to the missal contain elements of the liturgy of the Kraków diocese. The Mass Office on St Stanislaus includes the alleluia verse *Laeta mente, Stanislai* and the sequence *Sancte Dei pontifex*. It was most likely composed in Kraków in the early 16th century and used in diocesan books.<sup>65</sup> The text printed in the Jasna Góra copy has a very modest notation of the melody. Neumes were entered over both texts of the Lord's Prayer, the dialogue before the preface of weekdays, and the *Alleluia* sung on Easter Sunday.

The only known copy printed on parchment is in the Hungarian National Széchényi Library (ref.: Inc. 176).<sup>66</sup> Neumes are entered there for all prefaces except for the Sunday preface of Lent, Good Friday melodies for the improperia, the antiphons *Ecce lignum crucis* (only the beginning sung by the priest), *Laudes omnipotens* and *Hoc corpus quod pro vobis traditur*. The entire *Exultet* is also provided with musical notation.

The catalogue of incunabula in Slovakia by E. Kotvan notes another defective Pauline missal in the collection of the diocesan library in Rožnava. The brief catalogue description informs about the notation of neumes in it, however, without giving details.<sup>67</sup> Incunabulist literature of the early 20th century reported a Pauline missal in the library of the Benedictine abbey in Götweig. Vinzenz Werl wrote about it in the catalogue of incunabula in Götweig,<sup>68</sup> and Paul Heitz – in the album *Christus am Kreuz Kanonbilder*, where he included a reproduction

<sup>62</sup> I thank Ms Anna Ivanjek of the Manuscripts and Old Prints Department of the National and University Library in Zagreb for the information on the neumes.

<sup>63</sup> J.C. Oates, *A catalogue of the fifteenth-century books in the University Library Cambridge*, Cambridge 1954, p. 4035. For providing information about the musical notation on the cards mentioned, I thank Liam Sims of the Rare Books Department, Cambridge University Library.

<sup>64</sup> *Incunabula quae in bibliothecis Poloniae asservantur*, vol. 1, moderante A. Kawecka-Gryczowa, composuerunt M. Bohonos et E. Szandorowska, Wratislaviae 1970, p. 3802.

<sup>65</sup> J. Pikulik, *Śpiewy alleluia o świętych*, Warszawa 1995, p. 167.

<sup>66</sup> G. Sajó, E. Soltész, *Catalogus incunabulorum quae in bibliothecis publicis Hungariae asservantur*, Budapest 1970, p. 2295; J. Zbudniewek, *Zbiór rękopisów paulińskich w Polsce*, in: *Z badań nad polskimi księgozbiorami historycznymi*, vol. 12, ed. B. Bieńkowska, Warszawa 1992, p. 18.

<sup>67</sup> I. Kotvan, *Inkunábuly archivov, múzei a niektorých historických knižnic na Slovensku*, Martin 1964, p. 161; idem, *Inkunábuly na Slovensku*, Martin 1979, p. 851.

<sup>68</sup> V. Werl, *Die typographischen Incunabeln der Stiftsbibliothek zu Götweig*, London 1982, p. 1320.

of the canon woodcut. In the 1920s or 1930s this missal was sold and since then it has been missing.<sup>69</sup>

## Conclusion

The number and arrangement of printed musical fragments in the first printed Pauline missal exceeds most 15th-century missals, in which the pages with the notation of the melody were placed only before the canon.<sup>70</sup> Only in a few monastic missals was neumes notation provided for more feasts. Thus, the Pauline missal proves to be a source of great value in the study of 15th-century Mass chants. The importance of the individual copies of the missal is enhanced by the fact that the Pauline versions of the melodies recorded in them are known only in very few other sources – two handwritten missals from Göttweig and Sopron and a ritual from the National Széchényi Library. Only the Göttweig missal contains a notation of the Holy Week melody. Intonations of the fixed parts and prefaces can be found in the travelling missal from Sopron, and the Pauline *kyriale* can still be studied on the basis of the ritual.

The use of the spaces intended for writing musical notation in print varies from one copy to another. None of the volumes included all the melodies for which the editor of the missal had provided a special space. The extent to which the text was supplemented with neumes varied greatly, sometimes being close to completeness, as in the Zagreb copy, at other times limited to a few short notations, as in the case of the incunabula from Jasna Góra.

The reasons for the different treatment of individual chants can be found in the practice of liturgical life. Regularly performed prefaces were included in four of the five examined missals, with the only exception of the Jasna Góra copy which is almost devoid of neumes. On the other hand, the absence of the Holy Week melody may have had its pragmatic reason in the fact that at that time there was only one celebration gathering the whole convent, during which one missal was used.

The cognitive value of the musical notations in the preserved copies of the Pauline missal is enhanced by their provenance from monasteries in Austria, Croatia, Poland, and Hungary. Thus, they provide material for research on the relationship between the Pauline liturgy and local traditions. The analysis of the musical layer of the handwritten Pauline missal from the Jasna Góra Library has shown that it uses a notation typical of Poland rather than of Esztergom.<sup>71</sup> As the incunabulist study has shown, the surviving copies of the first edition of the Pauline missal provide material for further, musicological research into the Mass chorale in Pauline monasteries scattered in several Central European countries.

---

<sup>69</sup> P. Heitz, *Christus am Kreuz Kanonbilder der in Deutschland gedruckten Messbücher des fünfzehnten Jahrhunderts*, Strassburg 1910.

<sup>70</sup> I would like to thank Mr Bernhard Rameder of Graphisches Kabinett Stift Göttweig for this information.

<sup>71</sup> J. Kubieniec, op. cit., p. 138-142.

## Bibliography

### Printed sources

- Gyöngyösi Gregorius, *Vitae Fratrum Eremitarum Ordinis Sancti Pauli Primi eremita*, ed. Franciscus Hervay, Budapest 1988.
- Missale Eremitarum ordinis S. Pauli*, [Basel Johann Amerbach, about 1495].
- Missale Strigoniense 1484. Monumenta Ritualia Hungarica 1*, ed. B. Déri, Budapest 2009.

### Literature

- Analecta hymnica Medii Aevi*, vol. XLVII, Leipzig 1905.
- Bibliotheca Hungarica. Kódexek és nyomtatott könyvek Magyarországon 1526 előtt*, vol. 1: A–J, ed. C. Csapodi, K. Csapodiné Gárdonyi, Budapest, 1988.
- Cempura H., *Franciszkańskie mandatum w średniowiecznych rękopisach w Polsce*, „Musica Medii Aevi”, 3/1969, p. 113-129.
- Farkas D., *The main research results of Pauline liturgical chant in Hungary*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce. Źródła i początki*, ed. R. Pośpiech, Opole 2012, p. 413-432.
- Földváry M.I., *Pauline Customs and the Esztergom Use*, in: *Liturgy and Music in the History of the Pauline Order*, ed. E. Mateja, R. Pośpiech, Opole 2018, p. 55-61.
- Gancarczyk P., *Muzyka wobec rewolucji druku. Przemiany w kulturze muzycznej XVI wieku*, Toruń 2011.
- Geldner F., *Die deutschen Inkunabeldrucker: ein Handbuch der deutschen Buchdrucker des XV. Jahrhunderts nach Druckorten*, Stuttgart 1968-1970, vol. 1.
- Geldner F., *Printers and printing XV century*, in: *Encyclopedia of Library and Information Science*, vol. 23, New York 1978.
- Gesamtkatalog der Wiegendrucke*, <https://www.gesamtkatalogderwiegendrucke.de/> (accessed 3 June 2023).
- Gilányi G., *Preservation, Continuity, Archaism – Musical Notation in the Pauline Order between the 14th and 18th Centuries*, in: *Liturgy and Music in the History of the Pauline Order*, ed. E. Mateja, R. Pośpiech, Opole 2018, p. 151-165.
- Haegen P., *Basler Wiegendrucke. Verzeichnis der in Basel gedruckten Inkunabeln von Berthold Rupel bis Nikolaus Kessler mit ausführlicher Beschreibung der in Basel vorhandenen Exemplare*, Basel 1985.
- Halpron B., *The corespondence of Johan Amerbach*, Michigan 2000.
- Heitz P., *Christus am Kreuz. Kanonbilder der in Deutschland gedruckten Messbücher des fünfzehnten Jahrhunderts*, Strassburg 1910.
- Hubay I., *Missalia hungarica*, Budapest 1938.
- Incunabula quae in bibliothecis Poloniae asservantur*, vol. 1, moderante A. Kawecka-Gryczowa, composuerunt M. Bohonos et E. Szandorowska, Wratislaviae 1970.
- Kinkeldey O., *Music and Music Printing in Incunabula*, “The Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America”, 26/1932, p. 89-118.
- Kiss G., *Pre-tridentine sources of the Pauline Mass chant repertory*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce. Źródła i początki*, ed. R. Pośpiech, Opole 2012, p. 199-217.
- Kisbán E., *Historia zakonu paulinów macierzystej prowincji węgierskiej*, vol 1-2, transl. B. Natoński, Jasna Góra 2009.
- Kotvan I., *Inkunábuly archívov, múzei a niektorých historických knižnic na Slovensku*, Martin 1964.
- Kotvan I., *Inkunábuly na Slovensku*, Martin 1979.
- Kubieniec J., *Liturgia paulińska w Polsce. Źródła i specyfika*, in: *Liturgy and Music in the History of the Pauline Order*, ed. E. Mateja, R. Pośpiech, Opole 2018, p. 37-53.

- Kubieniec J., *Średniowieczne rękopisy liturgiczne z archiwum jasnogórskiego*, in: *Liturgia w klasztorach paulińskich w Polsce. Źródła i początki*, ed. R. Pośpiech, Opole 2012, p. 138-142.
- Meyer-Baer K., *Liturgical music incunabula. A descriptive catalogue*, London 1962.
- Nacionalna i sveučilišna knjižnica u Zagrebu, <https://www.nsk.hr/ispis-rezultata/> (accessed 1 June 2023).
- Norel J., *Gradual franciszkański z Płocka. Rękopis ms. 3IV5B z XIII w. z Biblioteki Wyższego Seminarium Duchownego w Płocku w świetle polskiej i europejskiej tradycji liturgiczno-muzycznej. Studium źródłoznawcze*, Kraków 2007.
- Notae musicae artis. Notacja muzyczna w źródłach polskich XI-XVI wieku*, ed. E. Witkowska-Zaremba, Kraków 1999.
- Nowowiejski A., *Msza święta*, Płock 1993.
- Oates J.C., *A catalogue of the fifteenth-century books in the University Library Cambridge*, Cambridge 1954.
- Pietras L., *Chorał gregoriański w dokumentach i praktyce paulinów*, "Dissertationes paulinorum", 18/2009, p. 5-23.
- Pikulik J., *Śpiewy allelujacyjne na niedziele po Zesłaniu Ducha Świętego jako kryterium ustalania proveniencji polskich rękopisów muzycznych*, in: *W kierunku chrześcijańskiej kultury*, red. B. Bejze, Warszawa 1978, p. 680-692.
- Przywecka-Samecka M., *Drukarstwo muzyczne w Europie do końca XVIII wieku*, Wrocław 1987.
- Przywecka-Samecka M., *Początki drukarstwa muzycznego w Europie. Wiek XV*, Wrocław 1981.
- Radó P., *Libri liturgici manuscripti bibliothecarum Hungariae*, Budapeszt 1947.
- Sajó G., Soltész E., *Catalogus incunabulorum quae in bibliothecis publicis Hungariae asservantur*, Budapest 1970.
- Sarbak G., *Das Buch–und Bibliothekswesen der Pauliner im Mittelalter*, in: *Beiträge zur Geschichte des Paulinerordens*, red. K. Elm, Berlin 2000, p. 41-62.
- Soltész E., *Die Erstaussgabe des Pauliner-Breviers*, „Gutenberg Jahrbuch“, 35/1960, s. 132-140.
- Szendrei J., *Notacja liniowa w polskich źródłach chorałowych XII-XVI wieku*, in: *Notae musicae artis*, ed. E. Witkowska-Zaremba, Kraków 1999.
- Török J., *A magyar pálosrend liturgiájának forrásai, kialakulása és főbb sajátosságai (1225-1600)*, Budapest 1977.
- Török J., *Die Paulinerliturgie in Ungarn*, in: *Beiträge zur Geschichte des Paulinerordens*, red. K. Elm, Berlin 2000, p. 125-134.
- Werl V., *Die typographischen Incunabeln der Stiftsbibliothek zu Göttweig*, London 1982.
- Zbudniewek J., *Zbiór rękopisów paulińskich w Polsce*, in: *Z badań nad polskimi księgozbiorami historycznymi*, vol. 12, ed. B. Bieńkowska, Warszawa 1992, p. 5-54.